# Human Trafficking, a Form of Modern Day Slavery: Causes and Recommendations

# Agwu Patience Uzoma

Linguistics And Literary Studies Department Ebonyi State University, Abakaliki Nigeria

ABSTRACT: Human trafficking is a worldwide problem where humans are trapped in coercion and exploitation. Some would say that slavery ended when the 13th amendment was passed in the USA in 1865. This unfortunately is not true. Slavery exists, but in several forms. Humans are still sold and bought against their own will. The format, however, is more modern and not so easy to spot. It is called Modern Slavery. The modern Slavery is a continuation of the historic slavery that has existed for hundreds of years. Under the name of Human Trafficking, it is in reality people forced to work for little or no pay. The victims are often vulnerable humans who end up living under coercion without a way out. Nobody knows the true numbers, but even conservative estimates suggest that at least 2.5million children, women and men are lured or forced across international borders every year- and many more are trafficked within their home countries and put to work against their will, often under deplorable and unsafe conditions, held captive by physical, psychological, or financial threats. The International Labour Organization (ILO) however estimates that approximately 21 million people are victims to human trafficking today. This figure represents more people than ever before in history. Meanwhile, the very foundation of the United Nations (UN) and the multi lateral Cooperation all over the world, is the Declaration of Human Rights, which draws out the most fundamental rights we have as human beings and as citizens of the world. Here, the freedom of the individual is highly valued. Article 4 states that "No one shall be held in slavery or servitude; slavery and the slave trade shall be prohibited in all their forms" (UNHR 1948). Trafficking in humans takes freedom away from the victims and is a violation of this article. This paper finds that human trafficking, as it is defined by International law, subsumes all forms of nonconsensual exploitation. That is whenever people are forced or lured into exploitation- no matter if movement of victims is involved- it is considered human trafficking. The paper aims at examining the causes of human trafficking and makes recommendations.

Keywords: Human, trafficking, modern, slavery, causes, recommendation.

Date of Submission: 10-12-2019 Date of acceptance: 22-12-2019

Date of Submission: 10-12-2019 Date of acceptance: 22-12-2019

## I. INTRODUCTION

Slavery did not end with abolition in the 19th century. Instead, it changed its forms and continues to harm people in every country in the world. Human trafficking is a modern form of slavery. Modern day slavery according to the Anti-Slavery Society includes exploitation of subjugate populations even when their condition is not technically called "slavery". Profits from modern slavery per victim are higher in developed economies, for example, in 2014,the EU and other developed economies made an estimated \$46.9 Billion USD in profit from modern slavery but in contrast, Africa is the region with the highest rate of modern slavery, with 7.6 victims per 1,000 people [1] [2]. In fact, Africa just recorded the highest rate of modern-day slavery in the world. Armed conflict, state-sponsored forced labor, and forced marriages were the main causes behind the estimated 9.2 million Africans who live in servitude without the choice to do so, according to the 2018 Global Slavery Index. And despite these practices being widespread, slavery has remained a largely invisible issue, in part, because it disproportionately affects the most marginalized members of society, such as minorities, women, and children [3]

The continent of Africa is therefore one of the region's most rife with modern day slavery. Slavery in Africa has a long history, within Africa since before historical records, but intensifying with the Arab slave trade and again with the trans-Atlantic slave trade; the demand for slaves created an entire series of kingdoms (such as the Ashanti Empire) which existed in a state of perpetual warfare in order to generate the prisoners of war necessary for the lucrative export of slaves. These patterns have persisted into the colonial period during the late 19th and early 20th century. Although the colonial authorities attempted to suppress slavery from about 1900, this had very limited success, and after decolonization, slavery continues in many parts of Africa even though being technically illegal [4].

Slavery in the Sahel region (and to a lesser extent the Horn of Africa), exist along the racial and cultural boundary of Arabized Berbers in the north and darker Africans in the south. Slavery in the Sahel states of Mauritania, Mali, Niger, Chad and Sudan in particular, continues a centuries-old pattern of hereditary servitude. Other forms of traditional slavery exist in parts of Ghana, Benin, Togo and Nigeria [5]. There are other, non-traditional forms of slavery in Africa today, mostly involving human trafficking and the enslavement of child soldiers and child labourers, e.g. human trafficking in Angola, and human trafficking of children from Togo, Benin and Nigeria to Gabon and Cameroon [6].

Although this exploitation is often not called slavery, the conditions are the same. People are sold like objects, forced to work for little or no pay and are at the mercy of their "employers".

Millions of people are being forced into slavery, by means of human trafficking. The ILO has estimated that a third of trafficking relates to economic exploitation, and people are compelled to work on farms, to perform domestic and construction work. Women and children are chiefly forced to work in the sex industry [7]. Their working conditions are similar to those of slaves. Although, the traffic in human beings may vary, due to factors, such as political and geographical conditions, the motive and characteristics are the same. Human trafficking, despite considerable opposition to it, is on the increase. It is very difficult to evaluate the degree of success achieved in combating this evil [8]. Human trafficking can be prevented, only if there is the active involvement of society. Since it is assumed that poverty and inequality are the driving forces behind trafficking, it is imperative to overcome them, it would be futile to depend solely on legislation to bring human trafficking to an end.

#### **Modern Day Slavery**

Modern day slavery, also known as contemporary slavery or neo-slavery is a global problem and refers to institutional slavery that continues to exist in present day society [9]. It is a topic that evokes many different emotions: fear, anger, sympathy and overarching sadness. Modern slavery includes forced labour, human trafficking, sexual exploitation, debt bondage and forced marriage. Estimates of the number of slaves today range from around 21 million to 70 million, depending on method used to estimate and the definition of slavery being used.

Anyone who is forced to work or marry and cannot refuse or leave is a victim of modern slavery [10]. Most victims (71%) are women, many in forced domestic work or marriages. Children arefound in every type of slavery from labour to sex trafficking to forced marriage. The youngest victim of forced marriage from the most recent ILO statistics was 9 years old.

Modern slavery in numbers

- 40.3 million people are in modern slavery across the world
- 10 million children are in slavery across the world
- 30.4 million people are in slavery in the Asia-Pacific region, mostly in bonded labour
- 9.1 million people are in slavery in Africa
- 2.1 million people are in slavery in The Americas
- 1.5 million people are in slavery in developed economies
- 16 million slavery victims are exploited in economic activities
- 4.8 million people are in forced into sexual exploitation
- 99% of people trafficked for sexual exploitation are women and girls
- 4.1 million people in slavery are exploited by governments US\$ 150 billion illegal profits forced labour in the private economy generates per year
- \*All estimates by ILO

## What is human trafficking?

Human trafficking involves recruitment, harbouring or transporting people into a situation of exploitation through the use of violence, deception or coercion and forced to work against their will [11]. The United Nations on its part have defined human trafficking as follows:

The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labor or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs [12].

In other words, trafficking is a process of enslaving people, coercing them into a situation with no way out, and exploiting them. It is a very evil practice that emerged from social, political and economic deficiencies [13]. Trafficked female children are at risk of being sexually abused and forced into prostitution, by their

employers. In addition, many women were taken to European countries like Italy, Germany, and the Netherlands. International traffickers entice women, by promising them employment. However, they do not keep up to their promises and force women into prostitution on their reaching the destination (Human Trafficking & Markov des Slavery)

Trafficking & Modern-day Slavery).



According to United States Department of State data, an "estimated 600,000 to 820,000 men, women, and children [are] trafficked across international borders each year, approximately 70 percent are women and girls and up to 50 percent are minors. The data also illustrates that the majority of transnational victims are trafficked into commercial sexual exploitation."However, "the alarming enslavement of people for purposes of labor exploitation, often in their own countries, is a form of human trafficking that can be hard to track from afar". It is estimated that 50,000 people are trafficked every year in the United States [14].

In recent years, the internet and popular social networking sites have become tools which traffickers use to find vulnerable people who they can then exploit. People can be trafficked for many different forms of exploitation such as forced prostitution, forced labour, forced begging, forced criminality, domestic servitude, forced marriage, and forced organ removal [15].

We note the following about human trafficking:

- Contrary to a common misconception, people don't necessarily have to be transported across borders for trafficking to take place. In fact, transporting or moving the victim doesn't necessarily define trafficking.
- When children are trafficked, no violence or coercion needs to be involved. Simply bringing them into exploitative conditions constitutes trafficking.
- Trafficking for sexual exploitation gets much attention. However, the majority of people are trafficked into labour exploitation.
- Many people who fall victim of trafficking want to escape poverty, improve their lives, and support their families. Often they get an offer of a well-paid job abroad or in another region. Often they borrow money from their traffickers in advance to pay for arranging the job, travel and accommodation.
- When they arrive they find that the work they applied for does not exist, or the conditions are completely different. But it's too late, their documents are often taken away and they are forced to work until their debt is paid off.

### Smuggling or trafficking?

People often confuse human trafficking and people smuggling. People smuggling is the illegal movement of people across international borders for a fee. On arrival, the smuggled person is free. Human

trafficking is different. The trafficker is moving a person for exploitation. There is no need to cross an international border. Human trafficking occurs at a national level, or even within one community. Human trafficking in numbers

- 51% of identified victims of trafficking are women, 28% children and 21% men
- 72% people exploited in the sex industry are women
- 63% of identified traffickers were men and 37% women
- 43% of victims are trafficked domestically within national borders

(Estimates by The United Nations Office for Drugs and Crime (UNODC))

#### II. CAUSES OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING

Irrespective of the form of trafficking, traffickers adopt and implement deception, fraud, terror, isolation, physical violence and debt servitude towards their captives. There are several factors that contribute to the ever growing business of human trafficking. These factors are the same in almost all regions and nations. They include poverty, unemployment, conflict and crisis ,extreme cultural and traditional practices and perspectives, ignorance, lack of proper education, tendency to migrate among children, lack of protective safeguards and legislation, economic opportunities and demand for cheap labour.

Poverty and unemployment are the main factors that contribute to the increase in human trafficking. Trafficked women and children are forced to work in dangerous and hazardous work environments. In several instances children are either injured or killed in these dangerous working conditions [6]. They are made to work as farm labourers, divers, street hawkers and domestic labourers. The parents of these children willingly allow traffickers to take their children, and the reason for this reprehensible behaviour is their abject poverty (Human Trafficking & Modern-day Slavery).

Slavery is also imposed by governments, not only by businesses or individuals. Rampant corruption among the authorities is of great help to these traffickers, and helps the latter to improve their business. Understanding the immense scope of the problem is a first step, but strong commitments from governments, employers, workers and civil society are crucial to getting victims out of slavery and ensuring that they have decent work [9].

Sex tourism is on the increase and women are ruthlessly trafficked as domestic labourers from developing nations. Organised marriages are performed between women brought from developing nations and foreign nationals. These are the new forms of sexual exploitation of women under sex tourism (South Africa; Human Trafficking Legislation to Be Gazetted for Public Comment).

Debt servitude has also been identified as one of the major causes for women and young girls to be trafficked. Several of such these trafficked individuals end up as the slaves of their masters. They have to work without any remuneration till their debt is redeemed. However, in many cases, the debt amount is increased every month, on account of the steep interest charged on it by the trafficker. This effectively keeps the trafficked persons in perpetual debt. The chief origin of this debt is the travel expenses provided by the traffickers, whilst transporting these persons. The employers of the trafficked women repay the loan amounts to the traffickers, and do not pay any wages to the women. Moreover, the employers confiscate their passports, and take all measures to prevent their escape [14]. As such, they take full advantage of the vulnerable condition of the trafficked women.

Now, one of the great achievements of the United Nations is the creation of a comprehensive body of human rights law—a universal and internationally protected code to which all nations can subscribe and all people aspire. The United Nations has defined a broad range of internationally accepted rights, including civil, cultural, economic, political and social rights. It has also established mechanisms to promote and protect these rights and to assist states in carrying out their responsibilities.

The foundations of this body of law are the Charter of the United Nations and the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, adopted by the General Assembly in 1945 and 1948, respectively. Since then, the United Nations has gradually expanded human rights law to encompass specific standards for women, children, persons with disabilities, minorities and other vulnerable groups, who now possess rights that protect them from discrimination that had long been common in many societies.

#### What Are Human Rights?

Human rights are rights inherent to all human beings, regardless of race, sex, nationality, ethnicity, language, religion, or any other status. Human rights include the right to life and liberty, freedom from slavery and torture, freedom of opinion and expression, the right to work and education, and many more. Everyone is entitled to these rights, without discrimination.

#### Who is at risk of modern slavery?

Modern slavery can affect people of any age, gender or race. However, most commonly, slavery affects people and communities who are vulnerable to being taken advantage of.

It can be someone living in poverty and having no real prospects for a decent job, who will accept a good sounding offer of a job abroad that turns out something else that what was promised. It can be someone from a community heavily discriminated against, such as Dalits in India, who will have to borrow money for a medical treatment from a wealthy farmer, and will fall into debt bondage for decades with no hope of help from corrupted authorities [15]. Or it might be a young girl who happens to live in a society where early marriage is completely acceptable, who will have no choice over marrying an older man.

Or it might be someone who happens to be born to a mother coming from a 'slave' cast, literally owned by their masters from the day they are born.

Slavery is also more likely to occur where the rule of law is weaker and corruption is rife. It can also happen to groups of people who are not protected by the law, for example migrants whose visa status is irregular are easy to blackmail with deportation. Many people think that slavery happens only overseas, in developing countries. In fact, no country is free from modern slavery, even Britain. The Government estimates that there are tens of thousands people in modern slavery in the UK.

#### What is government doing to control this menace-modern slavery?

Governments are doing a lot to curb the menace of slavery. As such the government credited with the strongest response to modern slavery are the Netherlands, the United States, the United Kingdom, Sweden, Australia, Portugal, Croatia, Spain, Belgium, Germany and Norway.

In the United Kingdom, the government has instituted major reforms in the legal system through the Criminal Finance Act effective from September 30, 2017. Under the act, there will be transparency in regards to interbank information sharing with law enforcement agencies to help to crack down on money laundering agencies related to contemporary slavery. The Act also aims at reducing the incidence of tax evasion attributed to the lucrative slave trade conducted under the domain of the law [4]. Despite this the UK government has been refusing asylum and deporting children trafficked to the UK as slaves. In contrast, the governments accused of taking the least action against it are North Korea, Iran, Eritrea, Equatorial Guinea, Hong Kong, Central African Republic, Papua New Guinea, Guinea, the Democratic Republic of the Congo and South Sudan.

Again,world leaders at the Sustainable Development Summit formally adopted 17 goals that focus on people, prosperity and the planet – with 169 targets listed to accomplish these goals. Goal 8 involves economic well being: "Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment, and decent work for all." One of this goal's targets (Target 8.7) is an end to slavery: "Take immediate and effective measures to eradicate forced labor, end modern slavery and human trafficking and secure the prohibition and elimination of the worst forms of child labor, including recruitment and use of child soldiers, and by 2025 end child labor in all its forms." The sustainable development goals (SDGs) are a new, universal set of goals, targets and indicators that U.N. member states are using to frame their agendas and political policies," explains The Guardian. "The SDGs follow and expand on the millennium development goals (MDGs), which were agreed by governments in 2001"

Due to the hard work of anti-trafficking advocacy groups, the Sustainable Development Goals specifically mention human trafficking in the targets of three goals: 5, 8, and 16. This has given us the hope that addressing this grave human rights violation will become a greater priority for countries and citizens around the world [3]. The SDGs focus on people, the planet, prosperity, peace, and partnership, aiming to "balance the three dimensions of sustainable development: the economic, social and environmental." The goals call for all countries – lower, middle, and upper-income – to stimulate prosperity, promote human rights, and protect the planet that we all share by setting international development targets.

The specifics of the three trafficking-related goals are:

- SDG 5: Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls
- SDG 8: Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all
- Goal 16: Promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development, provide access to justice for all and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels

The SDGs were designed to be integrated and holistic, and nations are looking to take a collaborative approach to reaching the targets. The 2015 TIP report stated

"No nation can end modern slavery alone. Eliminating this global scourge requires a global solution. It also cannot be solved by governments alone. The private sector, academic institutions, civil society, the legal community, and consumers can all help to address the factors that allow human trafficking to flourish."

We know that these goals cannot be achieved if we don't work together. Several efforts are already underway for organizations to lead the way in accomplishing these goals. For example, UNICEF helped to launch The Global Partnership to End Violence Against Children. The National Human Trafficking Resource Center in the United States has launched a Global Hotline Network to help more people escape situations of trafficking and access resources. More legislation is being passed to address trafficking, and more efforts are underway to collect stronger data on how many people are affected by this crime. It's going to take all of us to end these crimes against our world, so let's get started today. We can do it.

#### III. RECOMMENDATIONS

Ending modern-day slavery has been on the global agenda since it was included in The Universal Declaration of Human Rights in 1948. Since then, several U.N. treaties, protocols and conventions have shaped the international response to human trafficking. In 2000, the member states of the UN had consented to establish an anti – trafficking protocol. This protocol would supplement the UN Convention against organised crime. The Deputy Secretary General requested member states to ratify this protocol, which is a powerful instrument to prevent trafficking. However, eradicating slavery was not included in the narrower set of international development goals that the U.N. approved in 2001.A new set of goals restores anti-slavery work as a top priority. The elimination of slavery is one of the U.N.'s key objectives. Most experts believe that slavery will exist as long as there are economic disparities — and unscrupulous individuals willing to exploit others for profit. The measures and efforts of the government to counter human trafficking are always insufficient, ineffective, and unsound. Government officials take bribes and issue counterfeit papers to traffickers.

But that doesn't mean effective action isn't possible. We recommend that Slavery's ugly presence can be reduced or eliminated through these steps:

Raise public awareness of the existence of slavery in the global economy by listing products or services derived from forced labor.

Press for national laws and local statutes that make human trafficking a separate and distinct crime.

Reduce demand for commercial sex by increasing liabilities for those who purchase sex.

Enforce existing national prohibitions against slavery and human trafficking through increased reliance on transnational investigational work and data collection and sharing.

Limited employment opportunities have compelled many women to resort to immoral means of earning money. The sex industry is flourishing because of male migrant workers who live away from their families for extended periods. This creates a huge demand for sex workers. Many unemployed women have taken to the world's oldest profession, in order to survive. Effort should be made to reduce unemployment, promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all.

Gender inequality is rampant, and women who are the victims of such gender bias, are routinely deprived of educational opportunities. This has enhanced the number of illiterate women in search of means of survival. Effort should be made to reduce gender inequality and reduce human trafficking.

We align with Free the Slaves Executive Director Maurice Middlebergwhe says "We applaud the U.N. General Assembly for elevating the moral imperative to end slavery to a mandatory goal by a date certain," "Now the focus must be on making good on the promise. We therefore urge the secretary-general to mobilize the concerned U.N. agencies in a concerted effort to attack slavery and human trafficking.

We also strongly recommend that the U.N., in consultation with civil society, quickly establish metrics and benchmarks against which the progress of governments can be measured.

Consequently, it would be wise to adopt measures such as media coverage, and nationwide public awareness campaigns with students, educators, faith-based communities, and local partners like the YMCA and Girl Scouts.

Above all, we make emphasis that much effort should be made to focus on access to decent, stable work. This is because in too many places, people are without work, and the jobs that are available to them do not offer an escape from poverty. Poverty, as we have said before is one of the root causes for slavery and human trafficking. Situations of desperation are created when families and parents struggle to put food on the table, access health care, or afford school fees to educate their children. Offers to travel abroad in the hope of a better life become more tempting for parents and children alike. Many cases of human trafficking begin with an individual looking for decent work. If nations truly invest in economic opportunities over the years, we would address one of the main vulnerabilities that place people at risk to trafficking in the first place.

## IV. CONCLUSION

While many may associate slavery with the past, the sad truth is that slavery is a bigger issue in today's world. The numbers are greater than ever, and are only growing. There are a lot of myths surrounding modern-day slavery facts, and a huge amount of basic information that many are not aware of. Knowledge is power, and

in the effort to equip citizens with the tools to fight this growing threat, we have been able to show that modern day slavery is real. Looking at some more facts below we are greatly challenged to think more of better ways to change the present situation.

Modern slavery is a multibillion-dollar industry with estimates of up to \$35 billion generated annually. According to Walk Free Foundation, there were 46 million people worldwide enslaved in 2016 in the form of "human trafficking, forced labor, bondage from indebtedness, forced or servile marriage or commercial sexual exploitation", with an estimated 18 million of those in India. China is second with 3.4 million, followed by Pakistan (2.1 million), Bangladesh (1.5 million), and Uzbekistan (1.2 million). By percentages of the population living in slavery Uzbekistan tops with 4% of its population living under slavery followed by Cambodia (1.6%), India (1.4%) and Qatar (1.4%). Although these figures have also faced criticism for its inconsistency and questionable methodology. China is second with 3.4 million, followed by Pakistan (2.1 million), Bangladesh (1.5 million), and Uzbekistan (1.2 million). By percentages of the population living in slavery Uzbekistan tops with 4% of its population living under slavery followed by Cambodia (1.6%), India (1.4%) and Qatar (1.4%). Although these figures have also faced criticism for its inconsistency and questionable methodology. ] In 2013 the United Nations estimated that roughly 27 to 30 million individuals are currently caught in the slave trade industry. 4.3% of the population of Mauritania still remains enslaved. [needs update]

According to these needs update we note that despite being illegal in every nation, slavery is still present in several forms today. Slavery also exists in advanced democratic nations, for example the UK where Home Office estimates suggested 10,000 to 13,000 victims in December 2015.[needs update] This includes, forced work of various kinds, such as forced prostitution. The UK has recently made an attempt to combat modern slavery via the Modern Slavery Act 2015. Large commercial organisations are now required to publish a slavery and human trafficking statement in regard to their supply chains for each financial year. The Walk Free Foundation reported in 2018 that slavery in advanced democratic nations is much more common than previously known, in particular the United States and Great Britain, which have 403,000 and 136,000 slaves respectively. Andrew Forrest, founder of the organization, said that "The United States is one of the most advanced countries in the world yet has more than 400,000 modern slaves working under forced labor conditions." We have been able to establish thus:

- Slavery: forced to work without pay under threat of violence and unable to walk away.
- 27 million slaves in the world today.
- Slavery is not legal anywhere but happens everywhere.
- The majority of slaves can be found in India and in African countries.
- At least 14,500 slaves are trafficked into the US each year.
- Slaves work in fields, brothels, homes, mines, restaurants anywhere slave owners can feed their greed.
- Human trafficking is the modern-day slave trade.
- \$90 is the average cost of a human slave around the world.
- Slave owners use many terms to avoid the word slavery: debt bondage, bonded labor, attached labor, forced labor, indentured servitude, and human trafficking.

#### **REFERENCES**

- [1]. Brace, Laura (2004). The Politics of Property: Labour, Freedom and Belonging. Edinburgh University Press. pp. 162–. ISBN 978-0-7486-1535-3. Retrieved May 31, 2012.
- [2]. "Slavery in the 21st century". Newint.org. Archived from the original on May 27, 2010.
- [3]. Kevin Bales (2004). New Slavery: A Reference Handbook. ABC-CLIO. p. 4. ISBN 978-1-85109-815-6. Retrieved February 11, 2016
- [4]. White, Shelley K.; Jonathan M. White; Kathleen Odell Korgen (2014). Sociologists in Action on Inequalities: Race, Class, Gender, and Sexuality. Sage. p. 43. ISBN 978-1-4833-1147-0.
- [5]. "Findings Global Slavery Index 2016". 2016. Retrieved February 2, 2018.
- [6]. "Religion & Ethics Modern slavery: Modern forms of slavery". BBC. January 30, 2007. Retrieved June 16, 2009.
- [7]. Oxford English Dictionary, 2nd edition 1989, s. v. 'slave'
- [8]. "History of Europe Middle Ages Growth and innovation Demographic and agricultural growth", Encyclopædia Britannica.
- [9]. Kluge, F. Etymologisches Wörterbuch der deutschen Sprache. 1891, s.v. "Sklave"
- [10]. Waldman, Katy (May 19, 2015). "Slave or Enslaved Person? It's not just an academic debate for historians of American slavery". Slate. Archived from the original on May 20, 2015.
- [11]. Bales, Kevin (2004). New Slavery: A Reference Handbook. pp. 15–18. Retrieved March 11, 2011.
- [12]. Bales, Kevin (2004). "New Slavery: A Reference Handbook"
- [13]. Frost, Dan (2011). "Chattel Slavery". In Rodriguez, Junius P. (ed.). Slavery in the Modern World. 1. ABC-CLIO. p. 182. ISBN 978-1-85109-783-8.
- [14]. The United Nations Office for Drugs and Crime (UNODC))
- [15]. The United Nations and the Universal Declaration of Human Rights